SOUTH DAKOTA DEPARTMENT OF LABOR AND REGULATION DIVISION OF INSURANCE

IN THE MATTER OF)	
CHRISTINA HALE) FINAL DECIS	ION
) INS 24-010	

After reviewing the record and the proposed order of the Hearing Examiner in this matter,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that pursuant to SDCL 1-26D-4, the Hearing Examiner's Proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Proposed Order, dated May 23, 2024, is adopted in full.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the South Dakota Non-resident Insurance Producer License of the respondent will hereby be revoked.

Parties are hereby advised of the right to further appeal the final decision to Circuit Court within (30) days of receiving such decision, pursuant to the authority of SDCL 1-26.

Dated this _____ day of June, 2024.

Marcia Hultman, Secretary

South Dakota Department of Labor and Regulation

700 Governors Drive

Pierre, SD 57501

STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA DEPARTMENT OF LABOR AND REGULATION

IN THE MATTER OF CHRISTINA HALE

INS 24-010

NOTICE OF ENTRY OF PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSION OF LAW, AND DECISION AND FINAL DECISION

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN, that attached hereto, is a true and correct copy of the Proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision, and Final Decision entered by Marcia Hultman, Secretary of the South Dakota Department of Labor and Regulation, on June 11, 2024.

Dated this 12th day of June, 2024.

Callie A. Pospishil

OH forphil

Legal Counsel

South Dakota Division of Insurance

124 S. Euclid Ave., 2nd Floor

Pierre, SD 57501 (605) 773-3563

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Callie Pospishil, the undersigned, do hereby certify that on the date shown below, a true and correct copy of the Proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision, and Final Decision with respect to the above-entitled action was sent U.S. Certified Mail, U.S. First Class Mail, and electronic mail thereon, to the following:

Christina Hale 186 Rodonna Drive Smithville, TN 37166

Dated this 12th day of June, 2024 in Pierre, South Dakota.

Callie A. Pospishil

At from hil

Legal Counsel

South Dakota Division of Insurance

124 S. Euclid Ave., 2nd Floor

Pierre, SD 57501 (605) 773-3563

STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA OFFICE OF HEARING EXAMINERS

IN THE MATTER OF CHRISTINA HALE

INS 24-010 PROPOSED DECISION

This matter came for hearing before the Office of Hearing Examiners on 10:00 a.m., central time, on May 3, 2024, pursuant to a Notice of Hearing issued by the South Dakota Division of Insurance ("Division") on March 28, 2024. Frank A. Marnell appeared as counsel for the Division with its witness, Gavin Munson. CHRISTINA HALE did not appear, either in person or through counsel. The Division admitted its Exhibits 1 through 5 into evidence through its witness and moved that the Hearing Examiner enter these Proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Proposed Decision as a default disposition to this contested case.

ISSUE

Whether the Non-Resident Insurance Producer License of CHRISTINA HALE should be revoked due to violating the insurance laws of another state; failing to report all the administrative actions and failing to respond to Division inquiries regarding the actions, in violation of SDCL 58-30-167(2) & (8), 58-30-193, and 58-33-66?

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. CHRISTINA HALE was licensed by the Division as an insurance producer on April 12, 2023. The license has lapsed since the hearing. (Exhibit 1).
- 2. CHRISTINA HALE was subject to administrative actions in the states of Virginia and Pennsylvania. (Exhibits 2 & 3).
- 3. CHRISTINA HALE did not timely report the administrative action to the Division within 30 days.
- 4. The Division sent inquiries to CHRISTINA HALE October 13, 2023, and November 14, 2023, at the address of record regarding the licensure matters. (Exhibits 4 & 5).
- 5. CHRISTINA HALE did not provide a response to the Division. (Exhibits 4 & 5).
- 6. Any additional Findings of Fact included in the Reasoning section of this decision are incorporated herein by reference.
- 7. To the extent any of the foregoing are improperly designated and are instead conclusions of law, they are hereby redesignated and incorporated herein as conclusions of law.

REASONING

This case involves a request by the Division to revoke the South Dakota Non-Resident Insurance Producer's License of CHRISTINA HALE. As a consequence of the potential loss of Respondent's livelihood from the lack of licensure, the burden of proof in this matter is higher than the preponderance of evidence standard, which applies in a typical administrative hearing. "In matters concerning the revocation of a professional license, we determine that the appropriate standard of proof to be utilized by an agency is clear and convincing evidence." In re Zar, 434 N.W.2d 598, 602 (S.D. 1989). Our Supreme Court has defined "clear and convincing evidence" as follows:

The measure of proof required by this designation falls somewhere between the rule in ordinary civil cases and the requirement of our criminal procedure, that is, it must be more than a mere preponderance but not beyond a reasonable doubt. It is that measure or degree of proof which will produce in the mind of the trier of facts a firm belief or conviction as to the allegations sought to be established. The evidence need not be voluminous or undisputed to accomplish this.

Brown v. Warner, 78 S.D. 647, 653, 107 NW2d 1, 4 (1961).

SDCL 58-30-193 states that "[A]n insurance producer shall report to the director any administrative action taken against the insurance producer in another jurisdiction... within thirty days of the final disposition of the matter. This report shall include a copy of the order, consent order, or other relevant legal documents." SDCL 58-33-66(1) requires CHRISTINA HALE to respond to the Division and supply requested documents within twenty days from the receipt of a request. Also, the Division considers SDCL 58-30-167 (shown in pertinent part) as follows:

The director may... revoke or refuse to continue, any license issued under this chapter... after a hearing... The director may... revoke... an insurance producer's license... for any one or more of the following causes:

- (2) Violating any insurance laws or rules, subpoena, or order of the director or of another state's insurance director, commissioner, or superintendent;
- (8) Using fraudulent, coercive, or dishonest practices, or demonstrating incompetence, untrustworthiness, or financial irresponsibility in the conduct of business in this state or elsewhere;

• • •

The evidence indicates that CHRISTINA HALE violated the insurance laws of South Dakota and another jurisdiction; failed to report all the administrative actions, and failed to respond to Division inquiries regarding the actions. Her actions and inactions demonstrate lack of fitness or trustworthiness regarding activity in this state or elsewhere. Applying the law to the Findings of Fact, it is clear the Non-Resident Insurance Producer License of CHRISTINA HALE is subject to revocation and should be revoked. Pursuant to SDCL 58-30-170, the Division may revoke a lapsed license.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Division has jurisdiction over CHRISTINA HALE and the subject matter of this contested case. The Office of Hearing Examiners is authorized to conduct the hearing and issue a proposed decision pursuant to SDCL 1-26D-4.
- 2. The Division bears the burden of establishing the alleged statutory violations by clear and convincing evidence.
- 3. The Division established by clear and convincing evidence that CHRISTINA HALE violated SDCL 58-30-193.
- 4. The Division established by clear and convincing evidence that CHRISTINA HALE violated SDCL 58-33-66.
- 5. The Division established by clear and convincing evidence that the South Dakota Non-Resident Insurance Producer License CHRISTINA HALE is subject to revocation pursuant to SDCL 58-30-167(2) and (8).
- 6. Any additional Conclusions of Law included in the Reasoning section of this decision are incorporated herein by reference.
- 7. To the extent any of the foregoing are improperly designated and are instead findings of fact, they are hereby redesignated and incorporated herein as Findings of Fact.

Based on the above Findings of Fact, Reasoning, and Conclusions of Law, the Hearing Examiner enters the following:

PROPOSED DECISION

The South Dakota Non-Resident Insurance Producer License of CHRISTINA HALE should be revoked.

Dated this

Hearing Examiner

Office of Hearing Examiners

day of May, 2024.

523 East Capitol

Pierre, SD 57501

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify on May <u>23</u>, 2024, at Pierre, South Dakota, a true and correct copy of this Proposed Decision was mailed to each of the parties below.

July WcChlland
Julie McClelland
Legal Secretary

Christina Hale 186 Rodonna Drive Smithville, TN 37166 christinahale 1/14@gmail.com Frank A. Marnell Division of Insurance 124 S. Euclid Ave., 2nd Floor Pierre, SD 57501